



TWO OF A KIND:

*Lewis Carroll (white) and
Lev S Vygotskij (black)*

MOVE 1 WHITE Timeline: 00.00
For some minutes Alice stood without speaking, looking out in all directions over the country -and a most curious country it was. There were a number of tiny little brooks running straight across it from side to side, and the ground between was divided up into squares by a number of little green hedges, that reached from brook to brook. -I declare it's marked out just like a large chess-board! Alice said at last. -There ought to be some men moving about somewhere and so there are! she added in a tone of delight, and her heart began to beat quick with excitement as she went on. -It's a great huge game of chess that's being played - all over the world -If this IS the world at all, you know. Oh, what fun it is! How I wish I was one of them! I wouldn't mind being a Pawn, if only I might join though of course I should like to be a Queen, best.

MOVE 1 BLACK Timeline: 00.00
We found this unit of verbal thought in word meaning. Word meaning is an elementary "cell" that cannot be further analyzed and that represents the most elementary form of the unity between thought and word. The meaning of a word represents such a close amalgam of thought and language that it is hard to tell whether it is a phenomenon of speech or a phenomenon of thought. A word without meaning is an empty sound; meaning, therefore, is a criterion, of "word" its indispensable component. It would seem, then, that it may be regarded as a phenomenon of speech. But from the point of view of psychology, the meaning of every word is a generalization or a concept. And since generalizations and concepts are undeniably acts of thought, we may regard meaning as a phenomenon of thinking. It does not follow, however, that meaning formally belongs in two different spheres of psychic life. Word meaning is a phenomenon of thought only insofar as thought is embodied in

speech and of speech only insofar as speech is connected with thought and illuminated by it.

MOVE 2 WHITE Timeline: 00.11
-Why, I do believe we've been under this tree the whole time! Everything's just as it was! -Of course it is, said the Queen.
-What would you have it? -Well, in our country, said Alice, still panting a little, -You'd generally get to somewhere else - if you ran very fast for a long time as we've been doing. -A slow sort of country! said the Queen. -Now, here, you see, it takes all the running you can do, to keep in the same place. If you want to get somewhere else, you must run at least twice as fast as that!

MOVE 2 BLACK Timeline: 00.22
The unity of speech is a complex, not a homogeneous, unity. A number of facts in the linguistic development of the child indicate independent movement in the phonetic and the semantic spheres. The external and the semantic aspects of speech develop in opposite directions - one from the particular to the whole, from word to sentence, and the other from the whole to the particular, from sentence to word.

MOVE 3 WHITE Timeline: 00.54
-Now then! Show your ticket, child! the Guard went on, looking angrily at Alice. And a great many voices all said together -Don't keep him waiting, child! Why, his time is worth a thousand pounds a minute! -I'm afraid I haven't got one, Alice said in a frightened tone -There wasn't a ticket office where I came from. And again the chorus of voices went on. -There wasn't room for one where she came from. The land there is worth a thousand pounds an inch! -Don't make excuses," said the Guard. -You should have bought one from the engine-driver. Alice thought to herself. -Then there's no use in speaking. All this time the Guard was looking at her, first through a telescope, then through a microscope, and then through an opera-glass. At last he said, -You're traveling the wrong way.

MOVE 3 BLACK Timeline: 00.47
To get a true picture of inner speech, one must start from the assumption that it is a specific formation, with its own laws and complex relations to the other forms of speech activity. Inner speech is speech for oneself; external speech is for others. It would be surprising indeed if such a basic difference in function did not affect the structure of the two kinds of speech. Absence of vocalization per se is only a consequence of the specific character of inner speech, which is neither an antecedent of external speech nor its reproduction in memory, but is, in a sense, the opposite of external

speech. The latter is the turning of thoughts into words, their materialization and objectification. With inner speech, the process is reversed, going from outside to inside. Overt speech sublimates into thoughts. Consequently, the structures of these two kinds of speech must differ.

MOVE 4 WHITE Timeline: 01.13
-What sort of insects do you rejoice in, where you come from? the Gnat inquired. -I don't rejoice in insects at all, Alice explained, -Because I'm rather afraid of them at least the large kinds. But I can tell you the names of some of them. -Of course they answer to their names? the Gnat remarked carelessly. -I never knew them do it. -What's the use of their having names the Gnat said, -If they won't answer to them -No use to them, said Alice, -But it's useful to the people that name them, I suppose. If not, why do things have names at all? -I can't say, the Gnat replied.

MOVE 4 BLACK Timeline: 00.59
Our experimental results indicate that the function of egocentric speech is similar to that of inner speech: It does not merely accompany the child's activity; it serves mental orientation, conscious understanding; it helps in overcoming difficulties; it is speech for oneself, intimately and usefully connected with the child's thinking. Egocentric speech develops along a rising, not a declining, curve; it goes through an evolution, not an involution. In the end, it becomes inner speech.

MOVE 5 WHITE Timeline: 02.36
-This must be the wood, she said thoughtfully to herself, -Where things have no names. Wonder what'll become of my name when I go in? I shouldn't like to lose it at all - because they'd have to give me another, and it would be almost certain to be an ugly one. She was rambling on in this way when she reached the wood: it looked very cool and shady. -Well, at any rate it's a great comfort, she said as she stepped under the trees, -After being so hot, to get into the - into what? she went on, rather surprised at not being able to think of the word. -I mean to get under the - under the - under this, you know! putting her hand on the trunk of the tree. -What does it call itself, I wonder? I do believe it's got no name - why to be sure it hasn't! She stood silent for a minute, thinking: then she suddenly began again. -Then it really happened, after all! And now, who am I?

MOVE 5 BLACK Timeline: 01.15
With the progressive isolation of speech for oneself, its vocalization becomes unnecessary and meaningless and, because of its growing structural peculiarities, also impossible. Speech for

oneself cannot find expression in external speech. The more independent and autonomous egocentric speech becomes, the poorer it grows in its external manifestations. In the end, it separates itself entirely from speech for others, ceases to be vocalized, and thus appears to die out. But this is only an illusion.

MOVE 6 WHITE Timeline: 10.17
-You like poetry? -Ye-es, pretty well - some poetry, Alice said doubtfully.
-Would you tell me which road leads out of the wood? -What shall I repeat to her? said Tweedledee, looking round at Tweedledum with great solemn eyes, and not noticing Alice's question. -"The Walrus and the Carpenter" is the longest, Tweedledum replied, giving his brother an affectionate hug. Tweedledee began instantly:

The Walrus and the Carpenter walking close at hand;
They wept like anything to see
Such quantities of sand:
"If this were only cleared away,"
They said, "it would be grand!"

"O Oysters, come and walk with us!"
The Walrus did beseech.
"A pleasant walk, a pleasant talk,
Along the briny beach:
We cannot do with more than four,
To give a hand to each."

But four young Oysters hurried up,
All eager for the treat:
Their coats were brushed, their faces washed,
Their shoes were clean and neat-
And this was odd, because, you know,
They hadn't any feet.

Four other Oysters followed them,
And yet another four;
And thick and fast they came at last,
And more, and more, and more-
All hopping through the frothy waves,
And scrambling to the shore.

The Walrus and the Carpenter
Walked on a mile or so,
And then they rested on a rock
Conveniently low:
And all the little Oysters stood
And waited in a row.

"The time has come," the Walrus said,
"To talk of many things:
Of shoes and ships and sealing-wax-
Of cabbages and kings-
And why the sea is boiling hot-
And whether pigs have wings."

"A loaf of bread," the Walrus said,
"Is what we chiefly need:
Pepper and vinegar besides
Are very good indeed-
Now, if you're ready, Oysters dear,
We can begin to feed."

"But not on us!" the Oysters cried,
Turning a little blue.
"After such kindness that would be
A dismal thing to do!"

"The night is fine," the Walrus said.
"Do you admire the view?"

"It was so kind of you to come!
And you are very nice!"
The Carpenter said nothing but
"Cut us another slice:
I wish you were not quite so deaf-
I've had to ask you twice!"

"It seems a shame," the Walrus said,
"To play them such a trick.
After we've brought them out so far,
And made them trot so quick!"
The Carpenter said nothing but
"The butter's spread too thick!"

"I weep for you," the Walrus said.
"I deeply sympathize."
With sobs and tears he sorted out
Those of the largest size.
Holding his pocket-handkerchief
Before his streaming eyes.

"O Oysters," said the Carpenter.
"You've had a pleasant run!
Shall we be trotting home again?"
But answer came there none
And this was scarcely odd, because
They'd eaten every one.

-I like the Walrus best, said Alice.
-Because he was a little sorry for the poor oysters. -He ate more than the Carpenter, though, said Tweedledee. -You see he held his handkerchief in front, so that the Carpenter couldn't count how many he took: contrariwise. -That was mean! Alice said indignantly. -Then I like the Carpenter best if he didn't eat so many as the Walrus. -But he ate as many as he could get, said Tweedledum. This was a puzzler. After a pause, Alice began, -Well! They were both very unpleasant characters.

MOVE 6 BLACK Timeline: 01.45
Dialogue always presupposes in the partners sufficient knowledge of the subject to permit abbreviated speech and, under certain conditions, purely predicative sentences. It also presupposes that each person can see his partners, their facial expressions and gestures, and hear the tone of their voices. Dialogue implies immediate unpremeditated utterance. It consists of replies, repartee; it is a chain of reactions.

Intermission Time: 20 min
One may wonder in what way education and self-realization, along with the ability and opportunity to participate in the development of society, are specific South African problems. Power and resource distribution are not locally contingent problem structures. Basic premises: the education required to participate, and have the opportunity to influence, is the same regardless of outer circumstances in a modern society. In a report from the Scientific Council, adult didactics in Sweden are discussed, but many of the

lines of reasoning can be applied to children and youth. The report argues that life-long learning contributes to transcendence of the existing, to further development of democracy, and that it promotes diversity by strengthening the individual.

"Language is the medium which shapes notions of identity. This also means that didactical concepts and identities can be emphasized as linguistic constructions. Didactics are therefore inherent in stories where such identities are produced. Here one takes as a radical starting point the linguistic turn. One also sees didactics as something produced via power struggle and rhetoric." "One consequence of postmodern thought is that rhetoric has gained new esteem. This is fair enough, as it possesses many of the traits celebrated by the thinkers influenced by postmodernism – performativity, exertion of power, rather than truth, and puts language in focus rather than an "actual" reality. This also implies that didactics are inherent in linguistic constructions." "Evidently, didactics here function as a means to shape identities; they are articulated through speech – and lie, so to speak, in the stories. Furthermore, didactics as exertion of power becomes a central theme."

MOVE 7 WHITE Timeline: 23.55
-And if he left off dreaming about you, where do you suppose you'd be? -Where I am now, of course, said Alice. -Not you! Tweedledee retorted contemptuously.
-You'd be nowhere. Why, you're only a sort of thing in his dream! -If that there King was to wake, added Tweedledum, -You'd go out - bang! - just like a candle!
-I shouldn't! Alice exclaimed indignantly.
-Besides, if I'M only a sort of thing in his dream, what are you, I should like to know? -Ditto, said Tweedledum. -Ditto, ditto! cried Tweedledee. He shouted his so loud that Alice couldn't help saying,
-Hush! You'll be waking him, I'm afraid, if you make so much noise. -Well, it's no use your talking about waking him, said Tweedledum, -When you're only one of the things in his dream. You know very well you're not real. -I am real! said Alice, and began to cry. -You won't make yourself a bit realer by crying, Tweedledee remarked, -There's nothing to cry about.

MOVE 7 BLACK Timeline: 02.02
The living union of sound and meaning that we call the word is broken up into two parts, which are assumed to be held together merely by mechanical associative connections. Psychology, which aims at a study of complex holistic systems, must replace the method of analysis into units. What is the unit of verbal thought that is further unanalyzable and yet retains the properties of the whole? We believe that

such a unit can be found in the internal aspect of the word, in word meaning. A word without meaning is an empty sound, no longer a part of human speech. Since word meaning is both thought and speech, we find in it the unit of verbal thought we are looking for.

MOVE 8 WHITE Timeline: 24.07
-Oh, oh, oh! shouted the Queen, shaking her hand about as if she wanted to shake it off. -My finger's bleeding! Oh, oh, oh! Her screams were so exactly like the whistle of a steam engine, that Alice had to hold both her hands over her ears. -What is the matter?' she said, as soon as there was a chance of making herself heard. -Have you pricked your finger? -I haven't pricked it yet, the Queen said, -But I soon shall oh, oh, oh! -When do you expect to do it? Alice asked, feeling very much inclined to laugh. -When I fasten my shawl again, the poor Queen groaned out, -The brooch will come undone directly. Oh, oh! As she said the words the brooch flew open, and the Queen clutched wildly at it, and tried to clasp it again. -Take care! cried Alice. -You're holding it all crooked! And she caught at the brooch; but it was too late: the pin had slipped, and the Queen had pricked her finger. -That accounts for the bleeding, you see, she said to Alice with a smile. -Now you understand the way things happen here. -But why don't you scream now? Alice asked, holding her hands ready to put over her ears again. -Why, I've done all the screaming already, said the Queen. -What would be the good of having it all over again?

MOVE 8 BLACK Timeline: 02.17
In the absence of a system of signs, linguistic or other, only the most primitive and limited type of communication is possible. Communication by means of expressive movements, observed mainly among animals, is not so much communication as a spread of affect. A frightened goose suddenly aware of danger and rousing the whole flock with its cries does not tell the others what it has seen but rather contaminates them with its fear.

MOVE 9 WHITE Timeline: 31.13
-There's glory for you! -I don't know what you mean by "glory", Alice said. Humpty Dumpty smiled contemptuously. -Of course you don't till I tell you. I meant: -There's a nice knock-down argument for you! -But "glory" doesn't mean "a nice knockdown argument", Alice objected. -When I use a word, Humpty Dumpty said, in rather a scornful tone, -It means just what I choose it to mean neither more nor less. -The question is, said Alice, -Whether you can make words mean so many different things. -The question is, said Humpty Dumpty, -Which is to be master

that's all. Alice was too much puzzled to say anything, so after a minute Humpty Dumpty began again. -They've a temper, some of them - particularly verbs: they're the proudest - adjectives you can do anything with, but not verbs - however, I can manage the whole lot of them! Impenetrability! That's what I say!

-Would you tell me, please, said Alice, -What that means? -Now you talk like a reasonable child, said Humpty Dumpty, looking very much pleased. -I meant by "impenetrability" that we've had enough of that subject, and it would be just as well if you'd mention what you mean to do next, as I suppose you don't mean to stop here all the rest of your life. -That's a great deal to make one word mean, Alice said in a thoughtful tone. -When I make a word do a lot of work like that, said Humpty Dumpty, -I always pay it extra.

MOVE 9 BLACK Timeline: 02.30
The primary function of speech is communication, social intercourse. When language was studied through analysis into elements, this function, too, was dissociated from the intellectual function of speech. The two were treated as though they were separate, if parallel, functions, without attention to their structural and developmental interrelation. Yet word meaning is a unit of both these functions of speech. That understanding between minds is impossible without some mediating expression is an axiom for scientific psychology.

Intermission **Time: 20 min**

*I am he
As you are he
As you are me
And we are all together*

*I am the gate keeper
I am standing at the entry point
Deciding who is coming in
And who is getting out
I am the eggman
Watching them come and go
They are the eggmen
I am a strong force
Executing the power
I am the ruler of outside and inside
My realm is the gate*

I am the walrus goo goo g'joob

The feeling of security provided with the visualization of a safe building, i.e. the wall surrounding a building. So many walls, fences and barriers inside the city of Cape Town. The concept of the wall or the fence as a problem solver – the link between the physical and mental borders. The wall as a mental image of what is protected: that image derived from history in general, and considering South Africa

specifically. Is the school considered a safe place because it has a wall and high fences? Because it relates to this mental image, of how we consider ourselves as protected? What is the relation between power, security and norm? The report from the Scientific Council: "What is regarded as knowledge becomes important in the respect that the ultimate power is exercised through governing our means to communicate about the world. In this way we subordinate ourselves to "reason", which is inherent in ways of speaking about all kinds of things. This makes it possible to determine what is acceptable and what is unacceptable. Michel Foucault writes about "regimes of truth" – how exertion of power is established over a certain time via the production of truth. One example being how in the 20th century individuals were placed in institutions with reference to a medical/psychological truth in the form of diagnoses. Via these diagnoses, and instruments such as tests, individuals could be identified as belonging to normality, and separated from those situated on the other side of the line established. The most effective form of power exertion operated, and still operates with reference to 'science'."

MOVE 10 WHITE Timeline: 33.04
-Ahoy! Ahoy! Check! and a Knight, dressed in crimson armor, came galloping down upon her, brandishing a great club. Just as he reached her, the horse stopped suddenly: You're my prisoner! the Knight cried, as he tumbled off his horse. Startled as she was, Alice was more frightened for him than for herself at the moment, and watched him with some anxiety as he mounted again. As soon as he was comfortably in the saddle, he began once more -You're my - but here another voice broke in, -Ahoy! Ahoy! Check! and Alice looked round in some surprise for the new enemy. This time it was a White Knight. He drew up at Alice's side, and tumbled off his horse just as the Red Knight had done: then he got on again, and the two Knights sat and looked at each other for some time without speaking. Alice looked from one to the other in some bewilderment. -She's my prisoner, you know! the Red Knight said at last. -Yes, but then I came and rescued her! the White Knight replied. -Well, we must fight for her, then, said the Red Knight, as he took up his helmet and put it on. -You will observe the Rules of Battle, of course? the White Knight remarked, putting on his helmet too.

MOVE 10 BLACK Timeline: 02.37
What happens in the mind of the child to the scientific concepts he is taught at school? What is the relation between the assimilation of information and the internal development of a scientific

concept in the child's consciousness? As we know from investigations of the process of concept formation, a concept is more than the sum of certain associative bonds formed by memory, more than a mere mental habit; it is a complex and genuine act of thought that cannot be taught by drilling, but can be accomplished only when the child's mental development itself has reached the requisite level.

MOVE 11 WHITE Timeline: 33.48

-I'm afraid you've not had much practice in riding, she ventured to say, as she was helping him up from his fifth tumble. The Knight looked very much surprised, and a little offended at the remark. -What makes you say that? he asked, as he scrambled back into the saddle, keeping hold of Alice's hair with one hand, to save himself from falling over on the other side.

-Because people don't fall off quite so often, when they've had much practice.

-I've had plenty of practice, the Knight said very gravely: -Plenty of practice! Alice could think of nothing better to say than -Indeed? but she said it as heartily as she could. They went on a little way in silence after this, the Knight with his eyes shut, muttering to himself, and Alice watching anxiously for the next tumble.

-The great art of riding, the Knight suddenly began in a loud voice, waving his right arm as he spoke, -Is to keep...

MOVE 11 BLACK Timeline: 03.01

The scientific concepts evolve under the conditions of systematic cooperation between the child and the teacher. Development and maturation of the child's higher mental functions are products of this cooperation. Our study shows that the developmental progress reveals itself in the growing relativity of causal thinking, and in the achievement of a certain freedom of thinking in scientific concepts. The development of concepts, or word meanings, presupposes the development of many intellectual functions: deliberate attention, logical memory, abstraction, the ability to compare and to differentiate. These complex psychological processes cannot be mastered through the initial learning alone.

MOVE 12 WHITE Timeline: 45.23

-The Eighth Square at last!' she cried as she bounded across, and threw herself down to rest on a lawn as soft as moss, with little flowerbeds dotted about it here and there. -Oh, how glad I am to get here! And what is this on my head? she exclaimed in a tone of dismay, as she put her hands up to something very heavy, that fitted tight all round her head. -But how can it have got there without my knowing it? she said to herself, as she lifted it off, and set it on her lap to make out what it

could possibly be. It was a golden crown.

MOVE 12 BLACK Timeline: 03.10

Practical experience also shows that direct teaching of concepts is impossible and fruitless. A teacher who tries to do this usually accomplishes nothing but empty verbalism, a parrot like repetition of words by the child, simulating a knowledge of the corresponding concepts but actually covering up a vacuum.

MOVE 13 WHITE Timeline: 45.57

-Well, this is grand! said Alice. -I never expected I should be a Queen so soon, and I'll tell you what it is, your Majesty, she went on, in a severe tone (she was always rather fond of scolding herself)

-It'll never do for you to be lolling about on the grass like that! Queens have to be dignified, you know! -And if I really am a Queen, she said as she sat down again,

-I shall be able to manage it quite well in time. Everything was happening so oddly that she didn't feel a bit surprised at finding the Red Queen and the White Queen sitting close to her, one on each side : she would have liked very much to ask them how they came there, but she feared it would not be quite civil. However, there would be no harm, she thought, in asking if the game was over. -Please, would you tell me...

MOVE 13 BLACK Timeline: 03.14

There is never complete parallelism between the course of instruction and the development of the corresponding functions. Instruction has its own sequences and organization, it follows a curriculum and a timetable, and its rules cannot be expected to coincide with the inner laws of the developmental processes it calls to life. On the basis of our studies, we tried to plot curves of the progress of instruction and of the participating psychological functions; far from coinciding, these curves showed an exceedingly complex relation.

MOVE 14 WHITE Timeline: 59.17

She was standing before an arched doorway, over which were the words "QUEEN ALICE" in large letters, and on each side of the arch there was a bell-handle; one was marked "Visitors Bell" and the other "Servants' Bell." -I'll wait till the song's over, thought Alice, -And then I'll ring - the - which bell must I ring? she went on, very much puzzled by the names. -I'm not a visitor, and I'm not a servant. There ought to be one marked "Queen", you know. Just then the door opened a little way, and a creature with a long beak put its head out for a moment and said -No admittance till the week after next! and shut the door again with a bang. Alice knocked and rang in vain for a long time, but at last a very old Frog, who was sitting

under a tree, got up and hobbled slowly towards her. -Where's the servant whose business it is to answer the door, she began angrily. -Which door? said the Frog. -This door, of course! -To answer the door? he said. -What's it been asking of? He was so hoarse that Alice could scarcely hear him.

-I don't know what you mean, she said.

-I speak English, don't I? the Frog went on. -Or are you deaf? What did it ask you?

-Nothing! Alice said impatiently. -I've been knocking at it! -Shouldn't do that, shouldn't do that, the Frog muttered.

-Vexes it, you know. Then he went up and gave the door a kick with one of his great feet. -You let it alone, he panted out, as he hobbled back to his tree, -And it'll let you alone, you know. At this moment the door was flung open, and a shrill voice was heard singing:

"To the Looking-Glass world it was Alice that said,

-I've a sceptre in hand, I've a crown on my head.

Let the Looking-Glass creatures, whatever they be,

Come and dine with the Red Queen, the White Queen, and me!"

And hundreds of voices joined in the chorus:

"Then fill up the glasses as quick as you can,
And sprinkle the table with buttons and bran:
Put cats in the coffee, and mice in the tea-
And welcome Queen Alice with thirty-times-three!"

MOVE 14 BLACK Timeline: Draw

While the processes of instruction follow their own local order, they awaken and direct a system of processes in the child's mind that is hidden from direct observation and subject to its own developmental laws. To uncover these developmental processes stimulated by instruction is one of the basic tasks of the psychological study of learning.

Ola Nilsson

/ Cape Town and Stockholm 2012

Texts:

Carrol, Lewis: Through the Looking-Glass (1871)

Larsson, Staffan: Didaktik för vuxna – tankelinjer i internationell litteratur. Vetenskapsrådets Rapportserie, 12:2006. (Teaching adult - given lines in the international literature Swedish Research Council Report Series 12:2006)

Vygotskij, S Lev: Thought and Language, revised and edited by Alex Kozulin (1986)

All other text by Nilsson, Ola (2012)